Cross-cultural Ethics and Corruption

John Hooker
Tepper School of Business, Carnegie Mellon University, USA

Indiana University East
March 2022
Culture and ethics

- Every culture has **ethical norms** that allow the culture to function.
- But cultures often operate **differently**.
- So they often have **different norms**.
Outline

Part 1: Differences in ethical norms
- Rule-based vs relationship-based
- Implications for ethics and business
Outline

Part 2: Corruption around the world

- What is corruption?
- Kodak in Taiwan
- Financial crisis
- Enron in India
- LKK in China
- Leighton in Asia and Middle East
- Celtel in Africa
- Supply chains: Mattel in China
- Supply chains: Apparel industry in south Asia
Relationship-based = life is organized primarily around personal relationships.

- Africa, Asia, Middle East, South America
Rule-based = life is organized primarily by rules.

Australia, Europe, North America
Implication for ethics

- Relationship-based cultures

  Ethics based on *loyalties* that relationships require.
  - Family, friends, coworkers.
  - There are rules, but their authority comes from *people*.

  *Obligation to respect and obey those with authority.*
  - Parents, grandparents, ancestors, boss, ruler
  - Or society will break down.
  - Authority is based on *who one is*.

  *Value system emphasizes care and respect.*
Implication for ethics

- Rule-based cultures
  - Ethics based on rules that have authority in their own right.
    - Since no person has inherent authority.
    - The rules must be inherently logical and reasonable, because only logic and reason are universal.
  - Value system emphasizes equality and fairness.
Implication for business

Relationship-based cultures

Business consists of building relationships.
- To develop a mutual understanding based on personal trust.
- Nothing matters unless it is part of the relationship.
- Close supervision is expected.
Implication for business

Rule-based cultures

- Business consists of making deals.
  - To draw up contracts enforced by law.
- Nothing matters unless it is in the contract.
- Self-enforcement is expected.
Corruption around the world

Focus on corruption.

*Where different ethical norms are most obvious in business.*
Corruption around the world

Nothing said here is meant to imply that one culture is more corrupt than another.

Corruption occurs everywhere.
What is corruption?

Corruption corrupts.
What is corruption?

- Corruption **corrupts**.
- It undermines the system.
What is corruption?

- Corruption corrupts.
- It undermines the system.

- *Rule-based* and *relationship-based* systems are corrupted in different ways.
Corruption as culturally defined

- What is *corrupt* in one system may be *acceptable* in another.
  - *For example:* **cronyism** may be OK in a relationship-based culture.
  - Cronyism = taking care of your friends first.
  - But **cronyism** must be distinguished from **bribery**...
Kodak in Taiwan

- U.S. manager was posted in Kodak’s Taiwan branch.
  - He met with a team representing a potential Taiwanese supplier.


**Kodak in Taiwan**

- U.S. manager was posted in Kodak’s Taiwan branch.
  - *He met with a team representing a potential Taiwanese supplier.*
  - *When the team left, he noticed that one of them left his briefcase.*
While looking for the owner’s name, he found the case to be full of cash.
Kodak in Taiwan

Kickbacks ("commissions") are common in some industries but are corrupting nonetheless.

They are a form of bribery.

Why are they corrupting?
Kodak in Taiwan

- Chinese/Taiwanese business is often based on guānxì.
  - Relationship of mutual obligation and mutual trust.
  - Legal enforcement is unnecessary.
  - Requires cultivation over a long period.
  - A legitimate form of cronyism.
Kodak in Taiwan

- **Bribery short-cuts** the process of building *guānxì*.
  - *Relationship-based* systems tend to slide into bribery.
    - As rule-based systems can slide into cheating.
  - *Bribery/kickbacks do not provide the stable, long-term relationships required by a complex civilization.*

Three Gorges Dam, Yangtze River
Kodak in Taiwan

Receiving kickbacks (anywhere in the world) is strictly forbidden by Kodak company policy.

“Offering, giving, soliciting, or receiving any form of bribe is prohibited” (page 11).
Kodak in Taiwan

What to do about the briefcase?

The manager dispatched a trusted subordinate to return the briefcase to the owner.

He sent a vaguely worded message to the owner’s boss, stating that he was returning lost property.

- The owner clearly got the cash from his boss.
- Otherwise the manager would think the money was delivered.
Kodak in Taiwan

Lesson:

- *Cronyism is not the same as bribery.*

- **Responsible** *cronyism is not corrupting in a relationship-based culture.*
  - Responsible = deal with friends because you trust them to deliver, not simply because they are friends.
Kodak in Taiwan

Lesson:

- Cronyism is not the same as bribery.
- **Responsible** cronyism is not corrupting in a **relationship-based culture**.
  - Responsible = deal with friends because you trust them to deliver, not simply because they are friends.
- **However, cronyism is problematic in government.**
  - Chinese civil service exams introduced by Han Dynasty >2000 years ago.
The Legal Picture

- Common legal distinction:
  - A **bribe** is a payment intended to influence a decision.
  - An **extortion** payment is required to obtain something to which you are already entitled (in a timely manner).
  - A **facilitating payment** is a small, routine extortion payment
  - Example: Driver’s test.
**The Legal Picture**

**Common legal distinction:**

- A *bribe* is a payment intended to influence a decision.
- An *extortion* payment is required to obtain something to which you are already entitled (in a timely manner).
- A *facilitating payment* is a small, routine extortion payment.
- Example: Driver’s test.

**Laws governing payments in foreign countries**

- U.S. Foreign Corrupt Practices Act (1977)
- U.K. Bribery Act (2011)
- These laws tend to govern international norms, with the UK act gaining influence.
# The Legal Picture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Legal requirement</th>
<th>US</th>
<th>UK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Prohibits paying <strong>bribes</strong> to foreign <strong>government</strong> officials</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prohibits paying <strong>bribes</strong> to individuals in <strong>private</strong> firms abroad</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prohibits receiving <strong>bribes</strong> in foreign countries</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prohibits <strong>facilitating payments</strong> in foreign countries</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Maybe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A company is responsible for bribes paid or received by associated persons abroad (e.g. subcontractors)</td>
<td><strong>Ask your lawyer</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Legal Picture

_payments/gifts may be illegal in the host country.

\textit{Especially when government officials are involved.}
Efficiency vs. Stability

- Bribery is a natural weakness of relationship-based cultures.
  - *It is a shortcut to relationship building.*
Efficiency vs. Stability

Cheating is a natural weakness of rule-based cultures.

Due to minimal supervision.

As in financial crisis of 2008...
Financial Crisis of 2008

Subprime mortgage loans were popular in U.S. in early 2000s.

- 20% of mortgage market
- Borrowers failed to meet normal standards.
Financial Crisis of 2008

- Lenders sold mortgages to big banks.
  - To be repackaged as "Collateralized debt obligations" (CDOs)
  - Lenders became extremely lax on due diligence.
  - No one was watching.
Financial Crisis of 2008

- Ratings agencies gave CDOs triple-A ratings.
  - Banks pay agencies for ratings, resulting in conflict of interest.
  - Banks sold AAA-rated CDOs to unsuspecting funds worldwide.
  - Standard & Poor’s finally indicted in January 2015.
Financial Crisis of 2008

Credit default swaps gave the illusion of security.

- $62 trillion outstanding.
- Form of insurance, but not regulated as such.
- Sold without regard to adequate capital reserves.
Financial Crisis of 2008

CDOs became “poison” in 2008.

- Credit froze worldwide because assets could not be valuated.
- Highly-leveraged banks collapsed, or threatened collapse.
Financial Crisis of 2008

Result: Worst recession since Great Depression of 1930s.

- International scope.
- Europe is still recovering.
- Political fallout: More polarization, Congressional gridlock
Financial Crisis of 2008

Western-style corruption – Minimal supervision risks cheating and irresponsible behavior

- *Mortgages without due diligence.*
- *Over-leveraged banks in search of short-term profit.*
- *Improper ratings.*
- *Unsecured credit default swaps.*
Enron in India

The Dabhol electric power plant.

- India’s largest-ever private foreign investment.
- Bechtel & General Electric also involved.
**Enron in India**


- Addressed growing Indian economy & unreliable electricity supply.
  
  - Spearheaded by Enron executive Rebecca Mark.

  - In principle, a brilliant idea.
Enron in India

Rebecca Mark of Enron obtained guarantee of 25% ROI from Indian government.

- Yet electricity price projected to be 2 to 5 times prevailing rate.
- Due partly to reliance on LNG from Enron subsidiary in Qatar.
- Some suspected bribery on Enron’s part.
Enron in India

Indian political situation.

- Congress Party was in political trouble.
  - Party of Nehru, Indira Gandhi, Rajiv Gandhi, Sonia Gandhi.
  - Accused of corruption.
Enron in India

Indian political situation.

- Congress Party was in political trouble.
  - Party of Nehru, Indira Gandhi, Rajiv Gandhi, Sonia Gandhi.
  - Accused of corruption.
- BJP (Bharatiya Janata Party) exploited Hindu nationalism & discontent with Congress party.
  - BJP comes to power in 1998, with Vajpayee as P.M.
Enron in India

Enron’s apparent bribery became an issue in BJP campaign.

BJP leader Gopinath Munde stated…

- “It is reasonably clear that several unseen factors and forces seem to have worked to get Enron what it wanted.”

Journalist Raghu reported Enron’s offer of $1 million per year for him to keep quiet.
Enron in India

Much public protest.

Amnesty International cited rough treatment of demonstrators.
Enron in India

- Indian government backed off from deal after BJP took power.
- Bush administration pressured India.
  - Visits from Dick Cheney, Colin Powell.
  - Dropped the matter after 9/11, Enron troubles.
Enron in India

Power plant sat mostly idle for years.

2 state-owned companies took it over in 2006.

- NTPC Ltd and GAIL Ltd
- Through joint venture RGPPL = Ratnagiri Gas and Power Pvt Ltd
Enron in India

Power plant sat mostly idle for years.

- 2 state-owned companies took it over in 2006.
  - NTPC Ltd and GAIL Ltd
  - Through joint venture RGPPL = Ratnagiri Gas and Power Pvt Ltd

- Resumed operations in 2010.
  - Now operates at a loss.
  - Debt = Rs 10,000 crore ($1.5 billion)
  - Supreme Court dismissed all legal claims in 2019.
Enron in India

The lesson:

- *Work through connections in India’s relationship-based culture.*
  - Family, friends of family.
  - Contacts with high-ranking people.

- *Bribery is corrupting.*
  - Bribery of government officials is illegal.

- *Bribes are different from facilitating payments*
  - which are common, seen by bureaucrats as a necessary salary supplement.
Nepotism

Nepotism may or may not be corrupting.

Nepotism = hiring or promoting your relatives.

Often questionable in rule-based cultures.

- May put an unqualified individual in the job
- Viewed as unfair.

May be functional in relationship-based cultures...

“This is my nephew Skippy. He’s your new boss.”

“Nepotism” is a polite way of saying “you have no chance in hell of ever being promoted.”
LKK in China

LKK (Lee Kum Kee) food and health products.

- Founded in rural Guangdong province in 1888.
- By 2005, 3900 workers.
- Markets in 80 countries.
LKK in China

Remains a family-run business.

*Lee Man Tat is group chairman.*

- Appointed 4 sons to head company divisions after they studied in USA.
- He was well aware of their talents/weakness and placed them accordingly.
- Authority of father/uncle/grandfather in a Confucian culture can be an advantage for nepotism.
LKK in China

Lesson:

- Responsible nepotism need not be corrupting in a relationship-based context.

  - Responsible = hire relatives based on their loyalty to family and known talents, not simply because they are relatives
Wasta vs. Bribery

The Middle Eastern practice of *wasta* can slip into bribery...
Leighton in Asia and Middle East

- Major Australian construction firm.
  - Grew from minor firm to $7 billion business
    - Under leadership of Wal King.
  - Corruption scandal breaks
    - Shortly after Wal King’s departure in 2010.
Leighton Timeline

2007

Leighton buys 45% stake in Dubai-based Al Habtoor Engineering.

- To provide access to Gulf customers thru Riad al Sadik (left), Chairman of joint venture Habtoor Leighton Group.
- Got $515 contract to build Habtoor Palace Hotel.
- So far, no problems.
Malaysian middleman Pakianathan Srikumar helps Leighton secure $1 billion in projects.

- ...in Asia, Middle East, Iraq, India.
- He funneled **kickbacks** from Leighton to customers.
- Took a **10% cut** himself.
- According to a Leighton whistle-blower.
Leighton Timeline

2009

*Internal memo by acting Leighton CEO David Stewart says top executives knew of $42 million in kickbacks.*

- To get $750 million oil pipeline contract in Iraq.
- Paid to a firm (Unaoil) run by Iranian family with connections to Iraqi PM and oil minister.
- Srikumar was reportedly involved.
Leighton Timeline

2018 (May)

Leighton (now CIMIC) charged by UK Serious Fraud Office with violations of UK Bribery Act.

- Due to bribes paid to Iraqi officials.
- Still under investigation by Australian authorities.
Leighton Timeline

📅 2018 (May)
- Leighton (now CIMIC) charged by UK Serious Fraud Office with violations of UK Bribery Act.
  - Due to bribes paid to Iraqi officials.
  - Still under investigation by Australian authorities.

📅 2018 (August)
- Leighton Asia (part of CIMIC) involved in Hong Kong railway construction scandal.
  - Shoddy construction of underground station.
  - Contractor fled Hong Kong.
Leighton and Wasta

Wasta is influence.

A *wasta* is a person who provides influence through connections with important people.

- Originated in Arab culture as an intermediary between tribes.

*Srikumar and al Sadik* were wastas for Leighton.
Leighton and Wasta

**Wasta** need not be corrupt.

*Ideally, a wasta screens requests judiciously for a sheik, important family, or government official.*

- Helps the sheik to exercise his power wisely.

However, wasta can be corrupted.

*Especially if the wasta receives money from the client.*

- Conflict of interest.
Leighton and Wasta

Lesson:

- *al-Sadik* appears to be a legitimate *wasta*.
- *Srikumar*...
Leighton and Wasta

- *Wasta* is a necessity in the Middle East.
  - *More effective than bribery.*

- Legitimate *wastas* don’t take bribes or kickbacks.
  - *They are compensated in other ways.*
    - Increased prestige
    - Gratitude from authority figures they serve
    - Expectation that the favor will be returned someday.
**Celtel in Africa**

  - Mo Ibrahim (Sudanese) & Terry Rhodes (British)
Celtel in Africa


- Mo Ibrahim (Sudanese) & Terry Rhodes (British)
- Purchased $750K operating license, approval bogged down.
Celtel in Africa


- Mo Ibrahim (Sudanese) & Terry Rhodes (British)
- Purchased $750K operating license, approval bogged down.
- Requested meeting with officials.
- Awkward silence after introductions.
Celtel in Africa

Fax had requested $50K bribes for meeting. 

Was sent to Amsterdam office that morning.
Celtel in Africa

- Celtel gave up on this country.
- ...but found ways to avoid bribery elsewhere.
  
  - Helped finance schools in lieu of payments to politicians.
  - Organized event to publicize coming mobile phones.
    - Consumers pressured politicians to issue permit without further delay... or bribes.
Lesson:

In many relationship-based African cultures, bribery results from corruption of village leadership customs.

- Rational redistribution of wealth through leader’s patronage.
- Undermined by colonial-era disruption of village life and installation of Western-style government.
Supply Chain Ethics

Supply chains often stretch from a rule-based to a relationship-based culture.

*Contractual specifications may not cross the cultural divide.*
Mattel in China

In 2007, Mattel discovered that many of its toys were coated with lead-based paint.

- *Lead additive tastes sweet but is toxic to children.*
- *Mattel recalled about 1 million toys.*
- *Toys were sourced through a supply chain from China.*
- *What went wrong?*
Mattel in China

Fisher-Price sourced from Zhang Shuhong, manager of Lee Der Industrial Company. Zhang was totally dedicated to his job. He even lived in a small room at the factory.
Zhang obtained paint from his trusted *guanxi* partner Liang Jiacheng at Dongxiong New Energy.
Liang was short of pigment and ordered it over the Web from people he didn’t know.
Mattel in China

The supplier send lead-based pigment along with a forged certificate.

Mattel/Fisher-Price

Lee Der Industrial Co.

Dongxiong New Energy

Dongguan Zhongxin Toner Factory

Lead Free Certificate
When Mattel discovered the problem, the Chinese government revoked Lee Der’s export license. Zhang committed suicide.
**Mattel in China**

Weak link in the supply chain:

Transition from contract-based to relationship-based business.

Zhang considered it sufficient to trust his supplier Liang.

A Fisher-Price purchaser who had *guanxi* with Zhang could have learned that Zhang was not performing lead-free certification as required by the contract.
**Mattel in China**

Second link was OK:

Guanxi

Zhang’s trust in Liang was culturally appropriate.
Mattel in China

Chain broke at third link:

Culturally inappropriate trust of unknown party on the Web.
Apparel industry in south Asia

In April 2013, garment workers in Rana Plaza heard a loud noise.

- 8-story factory complex.
- A large crack formed in the building.
- An engineer urged everyone to evacuate.
Apparel industry in south Asia

Sohel Rana refused to close the building.

- Factory owners ordered workers to show up the next morning.
- Or lose their jobs and several weeks back pay.
Apparel industry in south Asia

- At 8:45 am, the building collapsed.
  - 1129 workers killed, >2000 injured
Apparel industry in south Asia

- Worst disaster in history of garment industry.
- But not an isolated event.
  - 289 killed in factory fire, Karachi, Pakistan, Sept 2012
  - 25 killed in factory fire, Lahore, Pakistan, Sept 2012
  - 117 killed in factory fire, Dhaka, Bangladesh, Nov 2012.
- Common theme: unsafe working conditions.
  - Locked exits
  - No fire extinguishers
  - Building code violations
Apparel industry in south Asia

Journalists found evidence in the rubble that Western firms were sourcing from these factories.

Most firms claimed they didn’t know about it.
Apparel industry in south Asia

Supply chain from factory that burned in September 2012, killing 117.

Cultural divide occurs here.

Tuba sent order to Tazreen rather than its own Wal-Mart compliant plant.

Contractual safety requirements didn’t cross the cultural divide.

Desire for worker safety can become part of relationships down the chain.
Apparel industry in south Asia

Third-party endorsement doesn’t always work.

Karachi plant received prestigious SAI (Social Accountability International) endorsement only a month before it burned.

NGO endorsement is itself subject to supply chain problems.
Apparel industry in south Asia

- Relationships can also convey information about personal reputation.
  - *This is key in relationship-based cultures.*
  - *Sohel Rana was a known corrupt political boss and drug dealer.*